

**California Bird Records Committee**  
**Minutes of the annual meeting at the offices of H.T. Harvey and Associates**  
**San Jose, California 18-19 January 2002**  
**(prepared by Kimball Garrett and Richard Erickson)**

CBRC members present: Richard Erickson (Chairman), Guy McCaskie (non-voting Secretary), Kimball Garrett (Vice-Chairman), Jon Dunn, Robert Hamilton, Tristan McKee, Joseph Morlan, Peter Pyle, Scott Terrill, John Wilson.

CBRC members absent: Michael Patten.

Friday, 18 January 2002 (at the home of Joseph Morlan and Robbie Fisher in Pacifica)

1. Election of members.  
The terms of Hamilton, Patten, and Pyle expired.  
Nominations:  
    Luke W. Cole  
    Michael M. Rogers  
    Mike San Miguel  
    Daniel S. Singer  
    John C. Sterling  
Cole, Rogers, and San Miguel were elected.

Saturday, 19 January 2002

1. Meeting called to order at 0920 hr. (Chairman presiding; newly-elected Rogers and San Miguel sitting in as non-voting participants).
2. Minutes of 2001 meeting were approved.
3. Election [*conducted 18 January, above*].
  - 3a. Should we solicit nominations from outside the CBRC? (cf. British Birds Records Committee and others); this point was discussed and it was agreed that we should search broadly for potential new CBRC members, but no formal mechanism for nominations from outside the Committee was proposed. "Calbirds" and other communication outlets will be used to increase public input in the nomination process.
  - 3b. Discussion of the future membership. A lengthy discussion centered around geographical issues (e.g. a need for central coast representation), and a better balance to reflect the diversity of California birders. Many potential candidates were mentioned and discussed. Four CBRC positions will open up in the next election, as the terms of Dunn, Garrett, McKee and Terrill expire.
  - 3c. The process of holding elections the evening before the main CBRC meeting—often with nominees present for most of the evening—was discussed and critiqued. Nominees are put in a potentially awkward position, so the process will be discontinued indefinitely. All agreed it would be a good idea to increase the presence of the CBRC at WFO meetings for greater opportunities for social interactions with the WFO membership.
4. Election of Secretary (one year term).  
Nomination: Guy McCaskie (Erickson); seconded by Dunn  
McCaskie elected unanimously.
5. Election of Chair (one year term).  
Erickson nominated by Garrett; seconded by Terrill; Erickson elected unanimously.
6. Election of Vice-Chair (one year term).  
Garrett nominated by Erickson, seconded by Dunn; Garrett elected unanimously.
7. State of the Committee.
  - 7a. Annual reports.  
1998 records (Erickson and Hamilton) – published in *Western Birds* 32 (1).  
1999 records (Rogers and Jaramillo) – for inclusion in *WB* 33 (1).

2000 records (Dunn and McKee) – Erickson will assist if Dunn’s tour commitments prevent him from completing report on schedule.

2001 records – Wilson and Garrett volunteered to co-author.

There was a brief discussion of authorship of CBRC reports, and how present system of changing authorship makes bibliographic searches for reports difficult; henceforth, “for the California Bird Records Committee” will follow the authors in the byline for each report. [Update from *Western Birds* editor, Philip Unitt: rather than add “California Bird Records Committee” to the byline, “California Bird Records Committee” will be listed in the annual index for *Western Birds*.]

7b. Circulation.

Batch size: batches typically include about 15 records, and Secretary will try to keep this batch size target.

Inclusion of videos: Secretary will not circulate videos in first round if good still photos are included (unless videos contain audio information not on audiotapes).

Batches are bunching up - this is unfair to those low on the circulation list.

7c. Budget: no change.

7d. Secretary’s comments and duties (cf. Chair’s duties) - guidance from the Committee.

1. Make recirculation requests obvious, as Secretary will not carefully read your comments in an effort to judge your intentions.
2. Be sure to sign in and out when you process batches.
3. Closure: recirculations, reopened records. A long discussion covered ideas concerning closure of both accepted and not accepted records (especially reopened ones), and no obvious consensus was apparent. This matter will be considered carefully in the Bylaws review, weighing past practices, existing Bylaws language, and desired Bylaws language. To be revisited at the 2003 meeting.

7e. Assignments/volunteers.

Checklist update (McCaskie). Dunn suggested that because the checklist is soon out of date, that blank spaces be inserted to add new species; McCaskie noted that this may necessitate a new group of pages, making the checklist much more expensive.

Public relations on the Internet. Brief discussion; Garrett will continue to post information about the CBRC.

Maintaining and updating the CBRC photo gallery continues to be done by Morlan. Brief discussion.

Presentation at the WFO Annual Meeting (10-13 October 2002 in Irvine, Orange County). Brief discussion; McCaskie will present something for the CBRC.

Web site update, including proposed search engine. In process, with help of David Blue.

Merging of the databases. Publication of the proposed CBRC book (see 15a below) will ease the need for this.

Voting manual for new CBRC members. McKee prepared a draft with input from Erickson and McCaskie; another draft will be circulated for additional input/final approval.

CBRC involvement with local bird clubs. No action.

CBRC cooperation with other records committees. No action.

Nationwide gathering of records committees (Dunn). Discussed at last American Birding Association board meeting; Ned Brinkley suggested as coordinator.

Solicitation of known documentation. Participation of all members is necessary for the CBRC to be as effective as possible.

7f. Update on cooperation from *North American Birds* regional editors. Dunn reported on a policy adopted by the ABA Board of Directors concerning cooperation between *NAB* regional editors and state and provincial records committees.

- 7g. Status of voice recordings archived at the California Academy of Sciences. Pyle will investigate and report back.
8. Proposed Bylaw Changes.
- 8a. Morlan/Erickson: Proposal to make public the meeting minutes by posting on the CBRC website. Posting will be done beginning with these minutes; no bylaw change necessary, but see 8d below.
- 8b. Wilson: "I don't think it's a problem but since we have by-laws to guide the workings of the committee then we should probably have provisions in the by-laws that allow for sub-committees. If the "Introduced Birds Sub-committee" is a standing committee then we should probably have something in the by-laws that states that as well. The record of the Red-crowned Parrot was sent out by the "sub-committee" but did not indicate who was on the sub-committee. I would think that that should be in the report before it is permanently archived. Maybe the next time the committee reviews the by-laws it can be discussed or if you want to make changes sooner it can be done." No action, but see 8d below.
- 8c. McCaskie: "I propose the words "photo and" be added between "which" and "sight" in the first line of Paragraph IID. This has not been addressed since the formation of the CBRC and the intent to review sight records only." Discussion followed. No action, but see 8d below.
- 8d. Given their experience with committee bylaws in general, the law, and the CBRC respectively, Wilson, Cole, and McCaskie will undertake a review of the CBRC Bylaws. Other members will provide generous input with the intention of formal action at the 2003 annual meeting
9. Introduced Bird Subcommittee.
- 5a. Report from Garrett. Database being developed to track species that may qualify for placement on California list. Summary handout provided.
- 5b. Appointment of 2002 Subcommittee: Garrett, Morlan, San Miguel.
10. Proposed Review List changes.
- Possible additions discussed included Brown Thrasher, Cape May Warbler, Bay-breasted Warbler, Rusty Blackbird; no action taken, but see 15e below.
- Possible deletions:
- Scarlet Tanager: Erickson moved, Pyle seconded motion to delete. Failed 4-5
- Reddish Egret: Dunn moved, McKee seconded motion to delete. Passed 6-3; Reddish Egret is removed from Review List after 2001.
- Yellow Rail: Pyle moved, Erickson seconded motion to delete. Failed 4-5.
- Mourning Warbler and Painted Bunting briefly discussed; no action.
- McCaskie noted that a by-law change regarding review list changes might be necessary; such that review list changes may be made by two-thirds of those members voting, rather than two-thirds of the CBRC membership. To be handled under 8d above.
11. Records for which Chairman/Secretary need direction or assistance.
- 11a. Short-tailed Albatross (1999-092) Pt. Pinos MTY 1-10 May 1999. last date?, multiple birds? Will re-review as three records.
- 11b. Dark-rumped Petrel (1992-130). Change county of nearest land to San Francisco, per e-mail from Mike Feighner to Garrett in response to a Calbird post: "Actually 75 mi sw of Pt. Reyes is in San Francisco County according to the nearest point of land rule (caused by presence of Farallon Islands)."
- 11c. Whooper Swan(s) (2001-064) Lower Klamath NWR SIS 9-10 Mar 2001. how many? returning bird? Will recirculate for decision.
- 11d. Harris's Hawk (2000-004) Tinemaha Reservoir INY 9 Jul 1999. Three circulations now complete but circulation begun in error? Will circulate for fourth and final time (see 13 below).
- 11e. Mongolian Plover (1996-118) Bodega Bay 2-3 Sep 1996  
Morlan: "In view of Chris Corben's comments, and the current Greater Sandplover, do you think another look at the record is warranted? I still think it's a Mongolian, but P. William Smith (who saw the bird and the current Bolinas bird) feels it may well have

- been a Greater.” Record reviewed by Pyle and others who remain confident the bird was a Mongolian Plover. No action.
- 11f. Xantus's Hummingbird (1987-174A) Yaqui Wells SD 27 Dec 1986.  
status of rereview? Stands 7-3 after second round of re-review. Erickson moved and Wilson seconded that record 1987-174A circulate for a third round; motion failed 4-5. Record stands as accepted.
- 11g. Blue-headed Vireo.  
review of old records (package from Steve Rottenborn). Secretary will circulate those records with details; those without any details will not be circulated. Morlan expressed concern for the process and dissented that only post-split records should be reviewed.
- 11h. White Wagtail (1998-173) Big Sur MTY 28 Sep 98.  
status of rereview? Will wait for publication of Alström book, due May 2002.
- 11i. Pine Warbler (1988-052A) Riverside RIV 1 Oct 1987.  
status of rereview? 7-3 after two rounds, stands as accepted.
- 11j. Scarlet Tanager (1986-108A) Dana Pt. ORA 23 Aug 1964.  
status of rereview? 8-2 after two rounds, stands as accepted.
- 11k. Common Grackles (2000-003) Long Beach, LA 2 Jan - 17 Mar 2000.  
How many and what sexes? First round tally: Garrett, Hamilton, Rogers and Terrill accepted 5 (sex not specified); Dunn accepted 3 males and 1 female; Jaramillo and Pyle accepted 3 females and 1 male; McKee accepted 4 (sex not specified); and Heindel and Patten accepted only 3 birds (sex not specified). Will circulate again for decision.
- 11l. Black-backed Oriole Tijuana River Valley SD 9 Apr - 1 Jul 2000 (2000-073) and 28 Apr - 24 Jun 2001 (2001-074)  
Accepted unanimously in January 2002 on the second circulation of 2000-073 and the first circulation of 2001-074, but new evidence obtained in winter 2002 (rediscovery of the bird). Will recirculate with the new evidence before reaching a final decision.
12. Records brought to the meeting at the request of a member.
- 12a. Arctic Loon (Erickson; end date disbelieved by C.A. Marantz, fide L.R. Bevier):  
7-23 Dec 1991 Morro Bay SLO 1992-083 17  
Disputed dates and other information will be highlighted in the next draft of the CBRC book and votes will be taken on them during the review process.
- 12b. Shy Albatross (Erickson).  
28 May 1996 Pt. Piedras Blancas SLO 1996-093 23  
Morlan moved (and received a second) that this record be re-reviewed based on subsequent accepted records; motion passed 6-3. Record will be re-reviewed.
- 12c. Masked/Nazca Booby review (Dunn). See 15d below.
- 12d. Pink-backed Pelican (2001-019) (Dunn); it was noted that David Fisher confirmed the identification of this bird as a Pink-backed Pelican. Record stands as accepted on identification, not accepted due to questionable natural occurrence.
- 12e. Eurasian Collared-Dove (Erickson). Brief discussion of the impending fall of California to this species (both from within and without). Records will continue to circulate.
- 12f. Yellow-bellied Flycatcher (Erickson).  
16-17 Oct 1987 [fide P.E. Lehman] Carpinteria SBA 1987-261 13  
Note that the 17 October date was in error; this was a one-day bird.
- 12g. Alder Flycatcher (Pyle).  
4 Sep 1985 Southeast Farallon I. SF 1985-187 12  
Pyle reviewed the record and chose not to pursue.
- 12h. Thick-billed Kingbird (Erickson).  
From Chris Brady (Calbird):  
The following are some 1st spring/last fall dates I observed the TBKI:  
April 19, 1996. I noted that on that day and on the 18th the bird was very quiet. "Return" Sept, 9<sup>th</sup>.  
March 21, 1997. "Return" Sept. 18<sup>th</sup>.  
March 8, 1998. "Return" ??  
From the draft CBRC book account:

- |  |                                  |           |          |    |       |
|--|----------------------------------|-----------|----------|----|-------|
|  | 7-8 Mar 1993                     | Pomona LA | 1994-057 | 19 | audio |
|  | returning 19 Oct 1993-4 Mar 1994 |           | 1994-057 | 19 |       |
|  | and 30 Nov 1995-24 Mar 1996      |           | 1995-126 | 21 | ph.   |
|  | and 9 Sep 1996-2 Mar 1997        |           | 1996-157 | 22 |       |
|  | and 30 Oct 1997-21 Feb 1998      |           | 1997-203 | 23 |       |
|  | and 14 Oct 1998-1 Mar 1999       |           | 1998-175 | 24 |       |
|  | and 2 Nov 1999-2 Mar 2000        |           | 1999-196 | 25 |       |
|  | and 29 Oct-23 Dec 2000           |           | 2000-152 | 26 |       |
- Garrett will contact Chris Brady and ask her to confirm each year's dates.
- 12i. Pyrrhuloxias (Hamilton, Erickson).
- |  |                   |                   |          |  |  |
|--|-------------------|-------------------|----------|--|--|
|  | 10 June 1998      | Pt. Loma SD       | 1999-044 |  |  |
|  | 23 Jul 1982 (2)   | Corona RIV        | 1983-013 |  |  |
|  | 7-10 May 1983     | vic. Lancaster LA | 1983-117 |  |  |
|  | 26-27 May 1983    | Encinitas SD      | 1986-089 |  |  |
|  | 19-23 Jul 1990    | San Miquel I. SBA | 1990-140 |  |  |
|  | 7 Feb-13 Mar 1999 | Costa Mesa ORA    | 1999-078 |  |  |
- Several members have misgivings about coastal slope and urban records, but no action was taken at this time.
- 12j. Painted Bunting update (Hamilton, Erickson).  
Brief discussion: Since 1998, reports of this species have increased markedly, both during fall migration and at other times of the year, and Hamilton believes that vagrants are occurring with greater frequency than in the past few decades. Since the pattern of natural occurrence may be in flux, Hamilton does not intend to publish his 1998 analysis, but he may revisit the issue in the future. In the meantime, older records of spring ASY males stand as accepted (because a majority of members did not vote to overturn original decisions) while recent records of the same have not been accepted. The system remains imperfect.
- 12k. Painted Bunting 7-3 (n.o.) after 4 rounds (Dunn).  
ASY male 31 Jul-1 Aug 1998 Borrego Springs SD 1998-182  
Stands as not accepted.
- 12l. Black Rosy-Finch:  
10-24 Feb 2001 Montgomery Creek Ranch near Benton 2001-057  
Will continue circulation.
13. Records without a decision after completion of the third round. All were discussed for varying amounts of time and will recirculate a fourth and final time.
- |                        |          |                    |                   |
|------------------------|----------|--------------------|-------------------|
| Manx Shearwater        | 1999-110 | Pigeon Pt. SM      | 21 May 1999       |
| Red-tailed Tropicbird  | 1998-159 | offshore VEN       | 14 Aug 1998       |
| American Oystercatcher | 1999-065 | Newport Beach ORA  | 6 Feb 1999        |
| Gray-tailed Tattler    | 1998-099 | Pt. Reyes MRN      | 24-26 May 1998    |
| Blue-headed Vireo      | 1999-087 | Pescadero SM       | 2 Jan 1999        |
| Gray Catbird           | 1999-081 | San Nicolas I. VEN | 8 Nov 1998        |
| Mourning Warbler       | 1999-015 | SE Farallon I. SF  | 13 Jun 1998       |
| Mourning Warbler       | 1999-025 | Santa Cruz, SCZ    | 17 Jun 1998       |
| Pyrrhuloxia            | 1999-078 | Costa Mesa ORA     | 7 Feb-13 Mar 1999 |
14. Supplemental List.  
Dunn moved and Garrett seconded the addition of Blue Mockingbird to Supplemental List; passed 8-1 (Pyle dissenting).
15. Miscellaneous items.
- 15a. Status of the California Rarities book; draft expected from Patten in spring 2002.
- 15b. State List:  
California Condor - extirpated status? (Erickson). Nesting (unsuccessful) occurred in the wild in 2001 for the first time since the 1980s. No action.
- 15c. Georeferencing of database (Garrett); very brief discussion, no action.
- 15d. CBRC publications list revisited (Erickson). No action.

- 15e. The slash category (McKee). [Discussed earlier, out of turn]. McKee analyzed the issue of adding to the review list pairs or groups of difficult to identify species (none of which is currently on the California list); this has been colloquially referred to within the CBRC as the “slash” concept. Garrett moved, Erickson seconded, a motion to limit “slash” species on the review list to species pairs or groups which have been considered conspecific in recent times; the effect of this wording would be to add Masked/Nazca Booby, White/Black-backed Wagtail, and (following pending split by A.O.U.), Hawaiian/Galapagos Petrel. Motion passed 8-1, Morlan dissenting. Similar species such as sand-plovers and wheatears do not fall into this category, but Gray-cheeked/Bicknell’s Thrush remains a potential addition to this group as Bicknell’s cannot be excluded as a possibility in most California records.
- 15f. Archiving notes, drawings. Wilson suggested use of "Tuffilm" (made by Grumbacher and available in any art supply store) or “Krylon” on field notes and sketches to make them erase-proof and water-proof. McCaskie will experiment with these substances.
- 15g. *Documentation* vs. simple reports - don’t credit the latter (Erickson). Existing CBRC policy.
- 15h. Single observer first state records (Dunn). A straw vote passed showing general agreement for a by-law requiring >1 (possibly >2) independent sets of documentation for first state records. By-law wording will be worked out and brought up at the 2003 meeting for consideration.
- 15i. Voting philosophies, especially concerning natural occurrence (Erickson). Brief discussion. This issue was also addressed in the voting manual prepared by McKee.
- 16. Closing.
  - 16a. Site and date of next meeting: Camarillo 18 January 2003. The CBRC will consider changing the standard date to accommodate members who have a difficult time meeting in January.
  - 16b. Appreciations:  
Peg Stevens, Jon Fisher, and the Western Foundation of Vertebrate Zoology - for ongoing support in archiving CBRC records;  
Hamilton, Patten and Pyle for varying years of service to the CBRC;  
Terrill and others at H.T. Harvey and Associates for hosting the weekend’s festivities;  
Joseph Morlan and Robbie Fisher for opening their home to the CBRC;  
David V. Blue for assisting McCaskie with computer issues.  
The Committee agreed that the Western Foundation of Vertebrate Zoology and H. T. Harvey and Associates should be thanked in CBRC written reports, web site, etc.
  - 16c. Meeting adjourned at 1907 hr.