

California Bird Records Committee
Minutes of the annual meeting at the Western Foundation of Vertebrate Zoology
Camarillo, California 17-18 January 2003
(prepared by Kimball Garrett and Richard Erickson)

Friday, 17 January 2003 (at the home of Walter and Morgan Wehtje)

CBRC members present: L.W. Cole, J.L. Dunn, R.A. Erickson (Chair), K.L. Garrett (Vice-Chair), G. McCaskie (Secretary), T. McKee, J. Morlan, M.M. Rogers, M. San Miguel, S.B. Terrill.

CBRC members absent: J.C. Wilson

1. Call to order at 2010 hr.
 2. Minutes of 2002 meeting approved.
 3. Election of members.
 - 3a. Discussion of future membership.
 - 3b. Election. The terms of Dunn, Garrett, McKee, and Terrill expire.
Nominations:
David M. Compton
Marshall J. Iliff
Todd A. McGrath
Kristie N. Nelson
Peter Pyle
Daniel S. Singer
John C. Sterling
Brian L. Sullivan
Jim Tietz
Outside suggestions: David M. Compton, Tim Manolis, Todd McGrath, Brad Schram, John C. Sterling, David Vander Pluym. Members responded positively to the outside input.
Elected were McGrath, Nelson, Pyle and Sterling.
 4. Election of Secretary (one year term) - Guy McCaskie nominated by Erickson, seconded by Garrett, and elected.
 5. Election of Chair (one year term) - R.A. Erickson nominated by Cole, seconded by Rogers, and elected.
 6. Election of Vice-Chair: M.M. Rogers nominated by Erickson, seconded by Cole, and elected.
- Evening session adjourned at 2220 hr.

Saturday, 18 January 2003

Meeting reconvened at 0845 hr at the Western Foundation of Vertebrate Zoology.

Same attendance as 17 January; guests: Linnea Hall (WFVZ) and Robert A. Hamilton (temporarily), and Todd McGrath.

7. State of the Committee.
 - 7a. Annual reports.
1999 records (Rogers and Jaramillo) – published in *Western Birds* 33 (1).
2000 records (McKee and Erickson) – published in *WB* 33 (3).
2001 records (Garrett and Wilson) – scheduled for inclusion in *WB* 34 (1).
2002 records – to be written by Cole and McCaskie.
2003 records – San Miguel and McGrath volunteered.
 - 7b. Circulation and archiving. Discussion included an acknowledgment of the deterioration of archived photographs, a partial review of the web-based practices of other bird records committees, and the idea of a national archive sponsored by the American Birding Association. A scanner and a volunteer would be helpful in digitizing archival material; David Vander Pluym was suggested as a possible volunteer. Dunn and Erickson agreed to

- draft a letter to other bird records committee chairs seeking their assistance in petitioning the ABA.
- 7c. Budget. PO Box cost is up to \$136/year; another file cabinet is needed at WFVZ.
- 7d. Secretary's/Chair's comments: Recommendations for members' cooperation in the smooth running of the Committee were discussed.
- 7e. Assignments/volunteers.
Public relations on the Internet – Garrett to continue as spokesman.
Maintaining and updating the CBRC photo gallery (Morlan). Lots of hits, but better updating needed.
Participation in documentation workshop(s) at the WFO Annual Meeting in New Mexico (July 2003). Robb Hamilton offered to assist, and all CBRC members are urged to attend.
Web site update (including proposed search engine?). No progress reported.
Posting of CBRC minutes and reports on WFO-CBRC web site – underway.
Nationwide gathering of records committees (Dunn) – no action.
Solicitation of known documentation – all must participate.
- 7f. Formal adoption of the voting manual for new members prepared by McKee; Cole moved (Morlan seconded) to post on CBRC web site; approved.
8. Proposed Bylaw Changes. There has been no movement on the Bylaws review called for in the 2002 meeting minutes, although McCaskie sent out proposed language for bylaw changes on 5 March 2002.
- 8a. Wilson (2002). "I don't think it's a problem but since we have by-laws to guide the workings of the committee then we should probably have provisions in the by-laws that allow for sub-committees. If the "Introduced Birds Sub-committee" is a standing committee then we should probably have something in the by-laws that states that as well. The record of the Red-crowned Parrot was sent out by the "sub-committee" but did not indicate who was on the sub-committee. I would think that that should be in the report before it is permanently archived. Maybe the next time the committee reviews the by-laws it can be discussed or if you want to make changes sooner it can be done." – No action.
- 8b. McCaskie. Change III.C(1)(b) to the following: "Members take office at the close of the Annual Meeting at which they were elected and serve until the close of the third Annual Meeting after election, ~~or until their successors are elected~~ and until they have voted on those records that had not received a final decision after three circulations and were discussed during the Annual Meeting (see VI.F(3(c))), and all records in circulation at the time of the Annual Meeting (see VI.G(8)). The Members-Elect may, at the discretion of the existing Committee, be seated, without *voting privileges*, during the remainder of the Annual Meeting at which they were elected."
Change adopted 9-0.
- 8c. McCaskie. In III.C(2) remove “, and may not nominate oneself” from the middle of the passage, as members are now limited to a single term.
Change adopted 9-0.
- 8d. McCaskie. Change the last sentence of III.C(2) to read: The Chair shall submit the names of the nominees to all Members at least three weeks in advance of the Annual Meeting.”
Change adopted 9-0.
- 8e. McCaskie: In III.D(3) change “must” in the last sentence to “shall” and remove “by mail.”
Change adopted 9-0.
- 8f. McCaskie: In VI.D and VI.G(10), change wording to show the abbreviated review process allowed records under review that have previously received a final decision, as

decided as the 2002 meeting (e.g., Xantus's Hummingbird). Proposed wording was sent out in March.

9. Introduced Bird Subcommittee.
 - 9a. Report from Garrett: Yellow-chevroned Parakeet, Mitred Parakeet, and Nutmeg Mannikin, at least, are "on the horizon."
 - 9b. Appointment of 2003 Subcommittee: Garrett, Morlan, San Miguel.
10. Proposed Review List changes.
 - Additions: Rusty Blackbird? (Dunn: average 5.4 since 1989, 4.4 for most recent ten years).
 - Deletions: Tricolored Heron? (Erickson: ten year average 3.6).
Yellow Rail? (Erickson: 71 records through 1999 but little change in general pattern for 100+ years).
Mourning Warbler? (Erickson: 115 records through 2001; latest ten year average 3.6).
Scarlet Tanager? (Erickson: 116 records through 2001; ten year averages 1972–1981 3.0, 1982–1991 4.0, 1992–2001 3.5).

No action taken on any of these species; Dunn agreed to further research Cape May and Bay-breasted warblers, San Miguel will research Brown Thrasher.
11. Accepted records for which the Chairman/Secretary need direction or assistance.

Glossy Ibis	May–Jul 2000	near Calipatria IMP	2000-109
27 May observation not accepted by a vote of 4-5, stands as not accepted.			
Whooper Swan	9 Mar 2001	Lower Klamath NWR SIS	2001-064
how many (1-5)? – will recirculate.			
Ruddy Ground-Dove	4 Nov 2001–8 Mar 2002	Blythe RIV	2001-189
how many (1-5)? – 4 accepted by a 9-0 vote.			
Ruddy Ground-Dove	3 Nov–8 Dec 2001	Blythe RIV	2001-201
how many (1-5)? – 1 accepted by a 9-0 vote.			
Ruddy Ground-Dove	13 Oct 2001–11 May 2002	Furnace Creek Ranch INY	2001-199
how many (4-5)? – 5 accepted by a 9-0 vote.			
Pyrrhuloxia	27 May 2002	near Palo Verde IMP	2002-105
how many (1-2)? – only 1 accepted.			
Common Grackle	Jan–Mar 2001	Long Beach LA	2000-003
date span and how many? – 4 birds accepted, 2 Jan–10 Mar.			
Black Rosy-Finch	Feb 2001	near Benton MNO	2001-057
date span? – will recirculate.			
12. Records brought to the meeting at the request of a member.

Yellow-billed Loon	8–26 Dec 1976	Grant Lake MNO	1977-010	Dunn
reconsider in light of recent interior records? – will circulate anew to existing committee.				
Light-mantled Albatross	17 Jul 1994	Cordell Bank MRN	1994-124	Morlan
not accepted by the Checklist Committee of the American Birding Association – discussion, but no action taken, stands as accepted.				
Greater Shearwater	24 Feb 1979	Monterey Bay MTY	1979-017	Morlan
recirculate in light of recent records? – will circulate anew to existing committee.				
Glossy Ibis ("basic" plumage)	1-15 Jul 2000	Calipatria IMP	2000-110	Erickson
request for reconsideration from M.A. Patten – documentation reviewed but no action taken, stands as not accepted.				
Trumpeter Swan	22 Jan 1999	Staten I., SJ	1999-049	Erickson
more documentation from David Yee – will circulate anew.				
Harris's Hawks	various dates, places, and numbers			Erickson
reminder of our plan to review records after 5 years.				
Yellow Rail	5 Oct 1995	Ft. Bragg MEN	1998-132	McCaskie
observer requested reconsideration – documentation reviewed but no action taken, stands as not accepted.				
Gray-tailed Tattler	24-26 May 1998	Kehoe Beach, Pt. Reyes MRN	1998-099	Erickson
missing portion of record discussed.				

- Upland Sandpiper 5 Jun 1992 near Burnt Ranch TRI 1993-002 Erickson
feathers thought to be at WFVZ now appear to be lost.
- Sharp-tailed Sandpiper 5 Oct 1976 Santa Catalina I. LA 1980-002 Erickson
request for reconsideration from R.A. Hamilton – there was a general discussion of older records
with limited documentation; a thorough review of such records may be undertaken in the future;
no action taken, stands as accepted.
- Eurasian Collared-Dove various dates, places, and numbers McCaskie/Erickson
a single packet covering the recent desert records will circulate to the new committee.
- Ruby-throated Hummingbird 12 Sep 1986 SE Farallon I. SF 1987-005 Erickson
request for reconsideration from S.N.G. Howell – will circulate anew to existing committee.
- Thick-billed Kingbird various winters Pomona LA various numbers Erickson
Garrett will acquire a summary of dates from Chris Brady.
- Blue-headed Vireos various dates, places, and numbers Erickson
historic records batch was stolen; Cole will reassemble what he can and report to the committee
in 2004.
- Red-throated Pipit 29 Sep 1984 Salinas, MTY 1984-226 McCaskie
withdrawal request from Don Roberson – will circulate anew to existing committee.
- Golden-winged Warbler 15–19 May 2001 Pt. Loma SD 2001-082 Erickson
unanimous vote to accept as Golden-winged x Blue-winged Warbler.
- Pine Warbler 9 Nov-29 Dec 2000 Long Beach, LA 2000-149 Erickson
returning? – Garrett and San Miguel will consult with Karen Gilbert and Tom Wurster prior to the
2004 meeting.
- Pine Warbler 11 Nov-29 Dec 2000 Long Beach, LA 2000-149 Erickson
returning? – Garrett and San Miguel will consult with Karen Gilbert and Tom Wurster prior to the
2004 meeting.
- Worm-eating Warbler 21 Oct 1983 Santa Clara R. estuary, VEN 1994-068 McCaskie
more documentation from observer? – will circulate anew to the existing committee.
13. Records without a decision after completion of the third round. All were discussed for varying
amounts of time and will recirculate a fourth and final time.
- | | | | |
|--------------------------|------------------------|--------------------------|------------|
| Yellow-billed Loon | 21 Feb 2000 | Tule Lake NWR SIS | 2000-057 |
| Harris's Hawk | 6 Apr 1996 | Antelope Valley LA | 1996-080HA |
| Lesser Black-backed Gull | 22 Dec 1998–7 Mar 1999 | Salton Sea IMP | 1999-061A |
| Lesser Black-backed Gull | 21 Nov–5 Dec 1999 | Salton Sea IMP | 2000-001 |
| Thick-billed Murre | 4 Oct 1999 | Santa Cruz SCZ | 2000-056 |
| Greater Pewee | 20 Jan 1998 | Brock Ranch IMP | 2001-053 |
| Arctic Warbler | 7 Sep 2000 | Moffett Field SCL | 2000-138 |
| Yellow Wagtail | 12 Sep 1999 | Southeast Farallon I. SF | 2000-082 |
| Mourning Warbler | 27 Sep 2000 | Southeast Farallon I. SF | 2001-028 |
| Yellow-breasted Bunting | 5-6 Mar 2000 | Mission Hills LA | 2000-105 |
| Painted Bunting | 25 Nov—2 Dec 2000 | Los Angeles LA | 2000-148 |
14. Supplemental List.
Cole moved (San Miguel seconded) that Nazca Booby (*Sula granti*) be added to the Supplemental
List; motion passed 6-3.
15. Miscellaneous items.
- 15a. Completion of the California rarities book (Erickson/Hamilton).
An update on the book project was provided that emphasized the effort put in by Larry
Sansone as photo editor. Some funding is expected from Chevron-Texaco. WFVZ is
expected to cosponsor the book with WFO. Committee approval was sought for the
following:
- 1) change to consistent treatment of accepted “records;” i.e., always base totals on
number of individuals accepted; a long discussion ensued where it was noted that
the bylaws dictate as much but that this has not been followed for nesting records
and certain flocking species; a final decision was deferred to later when pre-
existing email information could be reviewed and an email vote taken.
[June 2003 update: motion accepted by a 7-1 email vote.]

- 2) statistical acceptance (*) of 3 skeletal specimens:
Brown Booby, 1966, south end Salton Sea IMP, LACM 52054
Hudsonian Godwit, 11 Nov 1980, N end Salton Sea RIV, LSUMZ 126414
Snowy Owl, 2 Dec 1916, Loleta HUM, MVZ 27606;
an attempt will be made to get data/documentation and circulate these records.
 - 3) statistical acceptance (*) of lost Tule Lake Upland Sandpiper specimen collected by Vernon Bailey and verified at the U.S. National Museum (Grinnell and Miller 1944). 8-0 for statistical acceptance (Cole moved, Dunn seconded; Morlan abstained).
 - 4) statistical acceptance (*) of lost Riverside Yellow-green Vireo specimen verified by Ridgway. Vote of 8-0 for statistical acceptance (Cole moved, San Miguel seconded; Morlan abstained).
- 15b. State List:
Nesting annotations (from CBRC 2000, Annotated list of the birds of California, *California Fish and Game* 86:186—207) will be added to the CBRC website, with the following updates: status of Fulvous Whistling-Duck will change from “N” to “n” to indicate irregular nesting; status of Yellow Rail will change from “(n)” to “n” to acknowledge recent records in the breeding season.
California Condor—extirpated status? (Erickson) – no action taken, will continue to monitor.
Steller’s Eider—no public specimen (Erickson) – specimen now lost altogether (S.W. Harris, 1996, *Northwestern California Birds*).
Mitre Parakeet—added to the American Ornithologists’ Union Check-list (McCaskie) – so noted, no action taken.
Nutmeg Mannikin (San Miguel) – will remain an issue for the introduced birds subcommittee.
- 15c. CBRC publications list revisited (Erickson). Discussion led to consensus to abolish.
- 15d. Single observer first state records (Dunn).
Motion by Dunn: “Single observer first state records lacking documentary evidence in the form of a specimen, photo, video or audio recording will no longer be reviewed. The Committee does encourage the submission of such records for archival purposes and such records will automatically be submitted for review once a subsequent record of that species or form is accepted.” A discussion ensued as to what constitutes two or more *independent* sets of documentation. No action on motion.
- 15e. Voting philosophies, especially concerning natural occurrence (e.g., Crested Caracara, San Miguel) and hybridization (Pyle). Brief discussion.
- 15f. How to obtain unsubmitted records (Erickson). Brief discussion.
16. Closing.
- 16a. Site and date of next meeting: H.T. Harvey and Assoc. in San Jose, 24 January 2004.
- 16b. Appreciations:
Dunn, Garrett, McKee, and Terrill for varying years of service to the CBRC;
Peg Stevens, Jon Fisher, Linnea Hall, and others at WFVZ for their ongoing support in archiving CBRC records, and for hosting the meeting;
Walter and Morgan Wehtje for opening their home to the CBRC once again.
- 16c. Adjournment. San Miguel moved, Cole seconded; meeting adjourned 1805 hr.