17 JAN 2014
Meeting called to order at 1:35pm, 17 January 2014 (Chair presiding). Members Joseph Morlan (Chair), Dan Singer (Vice-Chair), Guy McCaskie (non-voting Secretary), Jon Dunn, Kristie Nelson, Jim Pike, Peter Pyle, Steve Rottenborn, Adam Searcy, and Scott Terrill present.

Welcome and introductory remarks by Morlan.

2012 Minutes. No approval needed; approved in March 2012.

1. **Election of Members:** Prior to discussion of nominees and potential new members, discussion was held on the requirements members must meet in order to make nominations. Per the Bylaws, nominations must be made in writing to the Chair at least thirty days prior to the Annual Meeting.
   a. Election. The terms of Nelson, Pike, and Terrill expire.
   Nominations:
   - Thomas A. Benson
   - Brian Daniels
   - John Garrett
   - Justyn Stahl
   - Jim Tietz
   - David Vander Pluym

   Brian Daniels, John Garrett, Jim Tietz elected.

2. **Election of Chair** (one year term) – nomination: Joseph Morlan (Singer). Elected 8-0.

3. **Election of Vice-Chair** (one year term) – nomination: Dan Singer (Dunn). Elected 8-0.

4. **Election of the Secretary** (one year term) – nomination: Guy McCaskie (Nelson). Elected 9-0.

5. **Nominating Committee:** The committee agreed to form a subcommittee to facilitate the search for a new secretary. Dunn, Morlan, and Singer volunteered and will report electronically to the committee during the course of 2014.

**Bylaw Proposals**
1. **Article II Section A:** Pyle proposed the northern boundary of California offshore waters be changed to conform with the nearest point of land principle. The motion (Dunn, Searcy) passed 9-0. The offshore waters are now defined as “Adjacent Ocean”,
which is herein defined as that area within the United States Fisheries Conservation Zone
where the nearest point of land is within 200 nautical miles of the California coast, except
where the southern boundary is affected by areas under the jurisdiction of Mexico
pursuant to international law.

2. **Article VI Section F 1(a):** Morlan proposed changing “year of receipt” to “year of
sighting” to conform to current practice. Motion (SBT, JLD) passed 9-0.

3. **Article VI Section F 1(a):** Morlan proposed adding “Records of the same bird but
circulated as a different species or form shall receive a new record number”. Motion
(SBT/JP) passed 9-0.

4. **Article VI Section F 1(e):** Morlan proposed adding “Instead of mailing, the batch
may be transmitted electronically. Motion (PP/JP) passed 9-0.

5. **Article VI Section F 2(b):** Morlan proposed adding “...unless the batch was
previously transmitted electronically.” Motion (SBT/KN) passed 9-0.

6. **Article VI Section F 2:** Dunn proposed adding new section (f). “If prompted on the
cover sheet members will vote as to whether the same or different bird is involved from a
previously accepted record. A simple majority will resolve the issue.” A vote of
“Possibly the same” means it will be considered new, while a vote of “probably the
same” means it will be folded in with the previously accepted record. Even if a decision
is reached, a member can question the result, but this will not result in another
circulation, rather the record will be brought to the next meeting for discussion and
resolution. Even if not prompted on the cover sheet, a member can vote that the record
under consideration is the same as another record previously accepted or presently in
circulation. On those occasions the records will be brought to a meeting for discussion
and resolution. The committee agreed that this is a procedural issue and doesn't require a
bylaw change. Passed 9-0.

7. **Article VI Section F 3(e):** Dunn proposed permitting continued circulation after
discussion at a meeting on 2nd and 3rd circulations. Motion (JLD/SBT) passed 9-0.

8. **Article VI Section I 6:** Morlan proposed an amendment so taxa other than species,
such as species pairs or superspecies, may be added to the Main List. Motion (PP/SR)
passed 9-0.

**Annual Reports**
1. The 2012 report is being authored by Pike, K. Garrett, and Searcy.
2. The 2013 report will be authored by Rottenborn, Daniels, McCaskie, and J. Garrett.
3. The 2014 report will be authored by Dunn and Singer.

**State List**
1. California Condor: Singer proposed revising the status. A motion (JLD/DSS) to change the status from “E” for “extirpated” to “RI” for “reintroduction in progress” passed 9-0.
2. Nazca Booby: Morlan proposed removal from the Supplemental List. A motion (JLD/AS) to do so passed 9-0.

Review List
Criteria for inclusion – five year review. After discussion a consensus was reached that current guidelines are sufficient.

Additions:
Frigatebird sp.
The committee voted to add this species group to the review list at the 2013 meeting, but implementation was delayed until 2014. A motion (Pike/Pyle) to remove the category from the review list failed 5-4.

Deletions:
The following species and species pairs were considered for removal from the Review List. Hawaiian Petrel, Galapagos/Hawaiian Petrel, Neotropic Cormorant and Pine Warbler were removed from the Review List.

Hawaiian Petrel / Dark-rumped Petrel
56 accepted records in the past ten years, 39 in the past four years, and 17 in 2013. At least nine sightings from cruise ships in 2013 went undocumented. Hawaiian Petrel regular at-sea range currently extends east and south into California waters and several individuals carrying transmitters have been tracked into California. A motion (SCR/JLD) for removal passed 9-0.

Blue-footed Booby
17 accepted records in the past ten years until a major incursion in September 2013 with over 200 recorded in the state. A motion (JLD/AS) for removal failed 6-3.

Neotropic Cormorant
43 accepted records with over 70 individuals in past ten years. Now regular, increasing and breeding in Imperial County and along the Colorado River. A motion (JLD/SBT) to remove passed 9-0.

Little Gull
In excess of 100 accepted records averaging less than 3 per year. No motion to remove.

Yellow-green Vireo
108 accepted records with a ten year average of 3.5 per year until 2013 when 13 records were submitted (12 accepted to date). Now more numerous than Red-eyed Vireo in California. A motion (SCR/PP) to remove failed 4-5.

Snow Bunting
126 accepted records with an average of 2.9 in past ten years. No motion to remove.

**Worm-eating Warbler**
124 accepted records with an average of 2.5 per year during past ten years. No motion to remove.

**Mourning Warbler**
143 accepted records with an average of 2.2 per year in past ten years. No motion to remove.

**Pine Warbler**
117 accepted records and averaging 5.2 per year in past ten years. Motion (JP/DS) to removed passed 8-1.

**Common Redpoll**
171 accepted records with the majority of these occurring during major influxes in 2012 and 2013. No motion to remove.

**Records brought to the meeting for discussion**

**Fourth and Final:**
The following records without a decision after three rounds of voting were brought to the meeting and discussed before a final circulation.

2011-229 Yellow-billed Loon in Santa Cruz SCZ
2011-160 Harris's Hawk over Point Loma SD
2012-048 Curlew Sandpiper at Ventura Co. Game Preserve VEN
2012-034 Iceland Gull near Davis YOL
2011-208 Gyrfalcon near Orick HUM
2012-242 Dusky-capped Flycatcher at Malibu LA
2011-113 Cave Swallow at Mountain View SCL
2011-188 Winter Wren in Santa Ynez Mts. SBA
2011-235 Winter Wren in San Francisco SF
2012-189 Winter at Pine Gulch Creek MRN
2012-143 Golden-winged Warbler in Oceano SLO
2007-308 Connecticut Warbler on SEFI SF
2012-219 Cape May Warbler in Goleta SBA

Meeting adjorned at 8:45pm.

18 January 2014
Meeting reconvened at 9:10am.

“Same Bird” records:
The committee reviewed procedures for voting on same bird issues with reference to Article V1 Section F 2. The following records involving unresolved same bird issues were discussed and resolved (details available in upcoming annual report):


**Great Shearwater** near SEFI SF 2013-103 and off Half Moon Bay SM 2013-167.


**White Ibis** at Baker SBE 2012-117 and at Carpinteria SBA 2012-141.

**Lesser Sand-Plover** at San Diego Bay SD 2013-090 and Pajaro Dunes Beach SCZ 2013-101.

**Hudsonian Godwit** at Salton Sea IMP 2013-065 and Mono Lake MON 2013-073.


**Other Specific Records discussed:**
The following records were brought to the meeting at the request of a member.

**2012-125 Hawaiian Petrel** off Pt. Conception SBA on 5 Sep 2012 – after two rounds accepted as Hawaiian Petrel by five members and as Galapagos/Hawaiian by four members. Record will continue circulation until decision is reached either in the third or fourth round.

**2013-047 Magnificent Frigatebird** at Malibu Lagoon LA 2 Apr 2013 – rejected after one round as Magnificent but accepted as frigatebird sp. Dunn requested continued circulation so record will go at least one more round. A motion (Dunn/Searcy) to review the following rejected Magnificent Frigatebird records as “frigatebird sp.” with new record numbers passed 6-3: 2011-053, 2011-130, 2011-161.

**2012-187 Masked Booby** off San Lorenzo River mouth SCZ 17 Nov 2012 – identification concerns by Pyle were discussed. No motion to recirculate; the record stands as accepted.

**1984-085 Red-necked/Little Stint** – Morlan solicited member opinion on the plausibility of getting tissue genetically tested for the specimen currently at the SDMNH. Rottenborn and Terrill agreed to have H. T. Harvey’s geneticist analyze tissue to try to identify the bird genetically.

**2013-076 White-rumped Sandpiper** – Some members questioned whether two or three birds were present during this record's circulation based on initial documentation reviewed by the committee. Additional photo documentation was presented at the meeting showing three birds were present. A motion (Dunn/Singer) to accept three individuals passed 9-0.
2009-009, 2009-010, 2009-049 Iceland Gull – Three rejected records from Yolo County were discussed. An accepted record from southern California (2013-029) of a bird similar to 2009-049 led to a motion (Dunn/Pike) to re-review 2009-049 and 2009-051. The motion passed 9-0.

2013-141 Yellow-green Vireo – A review of photographs persuaded two dissenting members that two birds were present at Point Loma, SD 21-28 September 2013, thus the record passed 9-0.

2006-094 Sedge Wren – Additional documentation submitted for this previously rejected record was not considered “new and substantial” and no motion was made to re-review the record.

2013-015 Snow Bunting – A photograph of a Snow Bunting thought to be taken at Sweetwater Reservoir, SD by an unknown observer in January 2013 was ultimately received by the committee second-hand. A motion (JLD/AS) to review passed 9-0.

2004-209 Snow Bunting – This record was accepted and published as occurring on SEFI, SF on 26 October 2004. New information obtained from the SEFI biologist's daily journal showed the bunting was present until 5 November. A motion (Singer/Pyle) to accept the expanded date range passed 9-0. The expanded date range will be published in the corrigenda of the next annual report.

General Records

Blue-footed Booby – Members agreed the 2013 invasion involving dozens of records of well over 100 individuals should be treated in one record comprised of a summary of occurrence with a sampling of photographs and documentation for some individuals.

Pyrrhuloxia – Dunn expressed concern that coastal Pyrrhuloxia records were being treated inconsistently, with some being rejected over natural occurrence concerns and others being accepted. All members agreed the species exhibits movement well away from its normal range, and that trying to distinguish which records might pertain to escapes is problematic. No motion was made to re-review any records.

Arctic Warbler – Dunn reviewed the anticipated split of this species based on a study by Alström et al. (2011) and how this may affect existing and future records in California. At least two taxa occur in Alaska. *P. b. kennecotti* breeds on the Alaska mainland, while the (soon to be former) subspecies, *examinandus*, which has been merged by some authors with *xanthodyras* of Japan, occurs rarely in the western and central Aleutians. Which taxa have occurred in California is not currently known.

Obvious Escapes

Yellow Grosbeak – A specimen was recently received by the LACM of a Yellow Grosbeak from a rehab center; it was found on street in the San Fernando Valley. While it
showed obvious signs of confinement, members agreed it would be valuable to review the record in light of a previous unaccepted record from Inyo County and the species’ status as a vagrant in Arizona. A motion (JLD/AS) to circulate the record passed 9-0.

**Venezuelan Troupial** – A record submitted by a former committee member of an obvious escaped caged bird involving a species with little or no chance of making its way to California on its own received no support for circulation.

**Budget** - The chair submitted the following budget to the WFO treasurer in December 2013:
- $225.00 for the P.O. Box.
- $50.00 for YouSendIt file service.
- $150.00 for web hosting (three years).
- $30.00 for domain name (three years).

$455.00
1. A brief discussion on the necessity of maintaining a P.O. Box led to a motion (Dunn/Singer) to discontinue it as of June 2014. Motion passed 9-0.

2. Voluntary donations to WFO for page charges. Members were reminded to consider making donations for page charges incurred by Western Field Ornithologists for the publication of CBRC annual reports.

**Website**

1. Redesign – committee decided not to prioritize updating the website at this time.
2. Updated submission form - Potential improvements to the online description form were outlined at the 2013 meeting. Accordingly, webmaster Joe Morlan made those improvements possible and these modifications were approved by the committee 9-0.
3. Rare Birds of California online. The chair reviewed and the committee discussed the current status of the project. While no motion was made, the following action items were discussed and Dunn agreed to present them to the WFO Publications Committee:
   a. The project needs CBRC input.
   b. The project needs to have the online corrigenda incorporated into the online version of Rare Birds, i.e. the online book should be corrected.
   c. The committee would like WFO to consider allowing the CBRC webmaster or some other designated person to have FTP access so changes or corrections can be made as needed.
   d. Morlan would like to be a member of the WFO Publications committee.
4. Upgrading the database – McCaskie identified four improvements needed to the Access database the committee currently maintains. These include 1) entering observer names; 2) finalizing batches; 3) querying multiple batches; and 4) updating the state list. Pyle will contact returning member Jim Tietz for possible assistance with querying multiple batches. Pyle agreed to initiate a search for someone who has the experience and willingness to assist with the improvements listed above.
Archiving
The committee reviewed current archiving practices and options for improvement. Currently paper copies and digital copies on CD/DVDs are stored at the Western Foundation of Vertebrate Zoology. Searcy will pursue the conversion of VHS videos to DVD as time permits and the technology to do so is accessible. Photos should be submitted as separate JPEGs rather than embedded in word processing documents.

Committee Spokesperson
Kimball Garrett agreed to continue to post occasional announcements to CALBIRDS on behalf of the committee.

Introduced Birds Subcommittee
The Introduced Subcommittee report is attached as an addendum to these minutes.

1. Subcommittee appointments – continuing members include Kimball Garrett (chair) and Jim Pike. Adam Searcy replaces Joe Morlan.
2. The committee approved the Garrett proposal to create an “official” list of naturalized species that don't meet the standards required to be on the state list.
3. Mandarin Duck was suggested for addition to the list of species. Members agreed further monitoring was necessary; Singer volunteered to research the species' current status in Sonoma County.

ID presentation/discussion

WINTER WREN
Pyle looked at eight accepted records and expressed concern about how useful plumage and vocalizations are and whether documentation being submitted is sufficient. The committee reviewed photographs, recordings, and discussed known and acceptable criteria for identification and documentation.

Lundy Canyon JLD/PP motion to recirculate despite initial approval passed 8-1 – simple majority required to re-review. As a previously accepted record, must receive a majority of no votes to overturn the record.

Stovepipe JLD/PP motion to recirculate based on new and substantial information passed 9-0 (increased understanding that underpart coloration doesn't overlap between Winter and Pacific wren).

Calls – both give multiple types of calls. The useful one is the kelp kelp (Song Sparrow like) versus the timp timp (Wilson's Warbler like) calls.
Appearance – dull BELOW, but can be bright above.
Skins – foxing might be an issue. Overlap appears restricted to upperparts.
NAZCA BOOBY
Dunn raised the subject of whether the white collar used by many as a diagnostic feature of young Masked Boobies in the Atlantic had any validity in the Pacific. After discussion the committee agreed that no advances we are aware of had been made in separating juvenile Nazca and Masked boobies. Most juvenile Nazca lack collars, and some unknowns percentage of juvenile Masked lack collars. More study is needed. Bill shape differs between the two species, with Nazca having a longer more attenuated bill, but to what extent this may be accurately assessed in the field isn't known. Young birds can't be distinguished until sometime during their second cycle.

RUSTY BLACKBIRD
Some young male Brewer's Blackbirds have more extensive buff fringing on the back than generally recognized, and a few hold this fringing into October. Rarely some may show very narrow buff fringing on some tertials and coverts. A review of photos led to a motion (JLD/ SBT) being passed 9-0 to re-review an accepted Rusty Blackbird record from Bodega Bay, SON from November 2010.

NEXT MEETING
1. If a quorum is available at the Western Field Ornithologists conference during 8-12 October 2014 in San Diego a short meeting may be held.
2. The next annual meeting will be in Camarillo on 23-24 January 2015 at the Western Foundation of Vertebrate Zoology.

APPRECIATIONS
1. Nelson, Pike, and Terrill for their service.
2. McCaskie for his continuing, critical work as Secretary.
3. Jim Tietz for maintaining updates on our web site.
5. Western Foundation of Vertebrate Zoology, Linnea Hall, and Adam Searcy for archiving services and support.

Adjournment

6:30pm, 18 January 2014.

Dan Singer – Vice-chair